

NONMETRIC TEMPORAL PATH ANALYSIS (NTPA):
AN ALTERNATIVE TO THE LINEAR MODELS APPROACH FOR
VERIFICATION OF STOCHASTIC EDUCATIONAL RELATIONS

By

Theodore Wayne Frick

Submitted to the faculty of the Graduate School
in partial fulfillment of the requirements
for the degree Doctor of Philosophy
in the School of Education
Indiana University
December 1983

Copyright by
Theodore Wayne Frick

1983

Accepted by the faculty of the Graduate School, Indiana University,
in partial fulfillment of the requirements for the Doctor of Philosophy
Degree.

George S. Maccini
Director of Thesis

Doctoral Committee:

Robert C. Pugh, Chairperson
Herbert Felt
Elizabeth Steiner

December 8, 1983

ABSTRACT

Extant statistical models commonly used in educational research are primarily linear and therefore deterministic. The linear models approach (LMA) is exemplified by correlational analysis, analysis of variance (ANOVA) and their extensions (path analysis, discriminate analysis, etc.). An alternative approach to verifying educational relations, developed by the author and termed, 'nonmetric temporal path analysis' (NTPA), is not constrained by the deterministic assumptions of the LMA and consequences thereof. NTPA is based on set, probability, information and general systems theory.

The major question addressed is: Is NTPA more adequate than the LMA in the verification of stochastic educational relations? Using data from an observational study of the academic learning time of mildly handicapped students, NTPA was compared to correlational analysis and ANOVA. It was concluded that NTPA is more complete than the LMA, inclusive of the LMA and a strong alternative to the LMA, since: 1) the LMA is derivable from NTPA; 2) NTPA describes relations not describable in the LMA, 3) NTPA can be reduced to the LMA, but not the converse; 4) NTPA and the LMA are empirically inconsistent given the same data; and 5) NTPA has higher empirical content than the LMA.

Given these criteria, NTPA is more adequate than the LMA for verification of stochastic educational relations. The fruitfulness of NTPA is patent, since a more adequate research methodology is likely to result in an increase in the rate of development of knowledge about educational systems processes and system-environment transactions.

ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

I remember clearly one evening in the late winter of 1976 when Dr. George Maccia explained to me the essential difference between a linear and information theoretic mapping of variables. While I had known of the difference, it was not until then that I became truly aware of the significance of the implications of this difference for educational inquiry methodology. The seed had been planted which eventually grew into the methodological verification procedure that I have developed, termed 'nonmetric temporal path analysis' (NTPA). I want to thank Dr. Maccia for that conversation in 1976 and for his continued support and encouragement, particularly when the idea of NTPA has been opposed, dismissed as trivial, or simply ignored by traditional research methodologists who are firmly entrenched in the linear models approach.

I want to thank Dr. Elizabeth Steiner for sparking my interest in educational inquiry methodology and introducing me to the SIGGS theory model. I continue to be impressed by her ability to get to the essence of an issue. The clarity of her insights, her persistence in questioning what is often taken for granted, the logic of her thinking, and most of all, her respect for persons as unique human beings have all been invaluable to my education.

It would have been difficult, if not impossible, to develop and test NTPA without the resources and support of the Center for Innovation in Teaching the Handicapped (CITH), School of Education, Indiana University. Dr. Melvyn I. Semmel, former director of CITH, now at the University

of California at Santa Barbara, created an environment where it was possible for me and others to explore individual research interests while at the same time working on a variety of research and development projects at CITH.

Dr. Herbert J. Rieth, present director of CITH, has continued to support this atmosphere for growth and development. In particular, it was he who gave me the opportunity to test NTPA in the context of a research study of the academic learning time of mildly handicapped students. His assistance, encouragement and provision of resources at CITH helped to make the dissertation a meaningful and satisfying experience.

Dr. Richard Pugh taught me many of the details of the linear models approach. Without knowing that research tradition, I would have been unable to discern the important differences between the linear models approach and NTPA. His open-mindedness, advice and support for completing this dissertation are greatly appreciated.

Finally, as always, my wife Kathy has provided the love and encouragement for me to pursue what I need to do and become.

TABLE OF CONTENTS

	Page
Acknowledgements	ii
List of Tables	vi
List of Figures, Schemas, and Specimens	vii
 CHAPTER	
1. The Problem	
Introduction to the Problem	1
The Linear Models Approach	2
Nonmetric Temporal Path Analysis (NTPA)	6
Meta-theoretical Considerations	7
Statement of the Problem	10
Overview of Following Chapters	12
 2. Theoretical Explication of Nonmetric Temporal Path Analysis	
Introduction to NTPA	13
Fundamental Assumptions about Observation and Data	
Structure	14
Basic Assumptions of Systematic Observation	16
Making Queries	19
Examples of Query Calculations	23
Rules for Query Syntax	24
Evaluation of Query Phrases	27
A Word about NOT	30
A Word about AND	30
Further Examples of Query Results	31
An Excursion into Recursion	31
Characterizing Queries for Recursive Decisions	37
Formal Definition of NTPA	41
General Remarks about NTPA	44
 3. Review of the Literature	
The Linear Models Approach	46
Contingency Analysis of Nominal and Ordinal Data	49
Sequential Analysis	54
Concluding Remarks	58

4. Empirical Comparison of Nonmetric Temporal Path Analysis
and the Linear Models Approach

Overview	62
Method	65
The Linear Models Approach: Correlational Analysis . . .	67
Nonmetric Temporal Path Analysis (NTPA)	70
A Comparison of NTPA and Correlational Analysis	72
The Linear Models Approach: Analysis of Variance	82
Independence of Observations	84
Observations Drawn from Normally Distributed Populations	85
Homoscedasticity	85
Homogeneity of Population Covariances	85
Comparison of NTPA and ANOVA	86
General Remarks Concerning NTPA and the LMA	87
Summary	90

5. Logical Comparison of Nonmetric Temporal Path Analysis
and the Linear Models Approach

Introduction	92
1. NTPA is More Complete than the LMA	94
1.1. The LMA is Derivable from NTPA	94
1.2. NTPA Describes Relations which Are Not Described by the LMA	95
2. NTPA is Inclusive of the LMA	96
2.1. The Conjunction of NTPA and <u>R</u> Includes the LMA, When <u>R</u> Is a Set of Translation Rules Matching Expressions in NTPA and the LMA . . .	96
3. NTPA is a Strong Alternative to the LMA	96
3.1. NTPA Includes all those Data, Phenomena, or Event Relations that the LMA Includes . . .	96
3.2. NTPA and the LMA Are Empirically Inconsistent	96
3.3. NTPA Has Higher Empirical Content than the LMA	97
Conclusion	97
Summary	97
Formal Definition of NTPA	100
General Remarks about NTPA	104
An Empirical Comparison of NTPA and the LMA	105
LMA Results	107
NTPA Results	107
Discussion	109

References	111
----------------------	-----

Vita	116
----------------	-----

LIST OF TABLES

Table	Page
1. Results of NTPA Queries of Data in Specimen 1	32
2. Results from Nonmetric Temporal Path Analysis	71
3. Joint and Marginal Probabilities for the Simultaneous Occurrence of Types of Instruction and Student Orientation to Instruction	78
4. Analysis of Variance Summary of NTPA-Aggregated Data	83

LIST OF FIGURES, SCHEMAS AND SPECIMENS

	Page
Figure 1. Graphic Illustration of $Y = B + AX + E$ in a Cartesian Coordinate System	4
Specimen 1. An Observational Record of the Weather Using Systematic Observation	18
Schema 1. CARTLO Syntax Rules	26
Figure 2. Partitioning of Query Phrase Relationships	36
Figure 3. Bivariate Distribution of Direct Instruction (DI) and Student Task Engagement (EN)	69